Gravity Trade Model with Firm Heterogeneity and Horizontal FDI

Jeff Luckstead, Stephen Devadoss, and Xin Zhao

Gravity Trade Model with Firm Heterogeneity and Horizontal FDI

Jeff Luckstead   Stephen Devadoss   Xin Zhao

Washington State University   Texas Tech University   Bayer

IATRC Annual Meeting
December 10, 2023

Introduction
oooooo

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
ooo

Estimation Procedure
ooo

Data
o

Results
oooo

Outline

Introduction
●○○○○○

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
○○○

Estimation Procedure
○○○

Data
○

Results
○○○○

Introduction

- ▶ Horizontal FDI industries:
    - ▶ parent company establishes affiliate firms in foreign countries & produces similar products.
- ▶ Proximity-conentration trade-off
    - ▶ firms choose exporting if <u>fixed building costs</u> are high or MNE operations if <u>variable trade costs</u> are high.

Introduction

- ▶ Horizontal FDI industries:
  - ▶ parent company establishes affiliate firms in foreign countries & produces similar products.
- ▶ Proximity-conentration trade-off
  - ▶ firms choose exporting if <u>fixed building costs</u> are high or MNE operations if <u>variable trade costs</u> are high.
- ▶ Markusen (2002) FDI impacts extensive margin and trade volume

Introduction

- ▶ Horizontal FDI industries:
    - ▶ parent company establishes affiliate firms in foreign countries & produces similar products.
- ▶ Proximity-conentration trade-off
    - ▶ firms choose exporting if fixed building costs are high or MNE operations if variable trade costs are high.
- ▶ Markusen (2002) FDI impacts extensive margin and trade volume

Does controlling for the impact of MNE operation in

- ▶ the proportion of exporting firms and
- ▶ bilateral trade flows

matter when estimating gravity equations?

Introduction

- ► Key studies
  - ► Helpman et al (2008) firm-level trade theory + gravity
  - ► Helpman (2004) firm-level trade theory and horz. FDI
- ► With fixed domestic, export, and MNE costs and
  - ► fixed export cost are sufficiently high
  - ► fixed export cost < fixed MNE costs

  Natural indexing of firms by size/productivity
  - ► MNE firms > Exporting firms > domestic only firms
- ► MNEs can be a small fraction of firms with large portion of sales.

Introduction

▶ FDI in the processed food became important circa 1980.

▶ Handy (1996) processed-food FDI
  ▶ due to the bulky nature of the raw materials,
  ▶ foreign affiliates utilize host country intermediate goods
  ▶ to produce their processed food to sell in the host country

▶ For an industry with relatively high trade cost,
  ▶ firms' choice b/t exporting and horiz. MNEs (Jabara, 2001)

▶ Processed food sector: consistent with a horiz.-FDI industry.

Introduction
○○○●○○
Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
○○○
Estimation Procedure
○○○
Data
○
Results
○○○○

Introduction

▶ Eurostat (2014-2016)
▶ On average, EU affiliate sales of processed food/beverages
  ▶ 15 and 12 times higher than exports in India and Brazil,
  ▶ but only 2.5 and 1.8 times higher in Russia and China.
▶ EU exports were 3 times larger than affiliate sales in Japan
  ▶ high entry barriers and building costs.
▶ Thus FDI influences processed food trade.

Literature

Irarrazabal et al. (2013) extend Helpman et al. (2008)

- ▶ Analyze exports vs MNE production with intrafirm trade
    - ▶ affiliate production utilizes inputs imported from headquarters and local inputs.
    - ▶ firm-level data, Norwegian firms, all manufacturing
- ▶ By contrast, our model
    - ▶ doesn't require firm-level data and is specific to horiz. MNE

Literature

Irarrazabal et al. (2013) extend Helpman et al. (2008)

▶ Analyze exports vs MNE production with intrafirm trade

  ▶ affiliate production utilizes inputs imported from headquarters and local inputs.

  ▶ firm-level data, Norwegian firms, all manufacturing

▶ By contrast, our model

  ▶ doesn't require firm-level data and is specific to horiz. MNE

Hejazi et al. (2017) utilize Helpman et al. (2008)

▶ Estimate a multinomial logit model, agri-food goods

  ▶ analyze the impact of tariffs on

  ▶ extensive margins of trade by considering the probability of

  ▶ a country-pair entering, maintaining, or exiting a trade relationship.

Introduction
○○○○○●

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
○○○

Estimation Procedure
○○○

Data
○

Results
○○○○

Contributions

There are four contributions:

1. develop a gravity model that captures the impacts of
   - ▶ firms' endogenous choice of horizontal MNEs v. exporting

   on bilateral trade.
2. three-stage estimation procedure:
   - ▶ MNE selection equation
   - ▶ export selection equation
   - ▶ gravity estimation of bilateral trade flows
3. show model correction for omitted variable bias
4. empirically apply method to the EU processed food

Introduction
oooooo

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
●oo

Estimation Procedure
ooo

Data
o

Results
oooo

Gravity Model

CES demand for export and MNE goods:

$x_{ij}^{e}(a) = \frac{p_{ij}^{e}(a)^{-\varepsilon}Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$ and $x_{ij}^{f}(a) = \frac{p_{ij}^{f}(a)^{-\varepsilon}Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$

▶ where Y_j is income, P_j is the CES price index, a is productivity, elasticity of substitution $\varepsilon = \frac{1}{1-\alpha}$.

Introduction
oooooo

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
●oo

Estimation Procedure
ooo

Data
o

Results
oooo

Gravity Model

CES demand for export and MNE goods:

$x_{ij}^e (a) = \frac{p_{ij}^e(a)^{-\varepsilon} Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$ and $x_{ij}^f (a) = \frac{p_{ij}^f(a)^{-\varepsilon} Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$

▶ where Y_j is income, P_j is the CES price index, a is productivity, elasticity of substitution $\varepsilon = \frac{1}{1-\alpha}$.

Pricing rules: $p_{ij}^e (a) = \tau_{ij} \frac{c_i^e a}{\alpha}$ and $p_{ij}^f (a) = \frac{c_j^f a}{\alpha}$.

Gravity Model

CES demand for export and MNE goods:

$x_{ij}^e(a) = \frac{p_{ij}^e(a)^{-\varepsilon} Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$ and $x_{ij}^f(a) = \frac{p_{ij}^f(a)^{-\varepsilon} Y_j}{P_j^{1-\varepsilon}}$

▶ where Y_j is income, P_j is the CES price index, a is productivity, elasticity of substitution $\varepsilon = \frac{1}{1-\alpha}$.

Pricing rules: $p_{ij}^e(a) = \tau_{ij} \frac{c_i^e a}{\alpha}$ and $p_{ij}^f(a) = \frac{c_j^f a}{\alpha}$.

Per-unit input requirement a:

▶ truncated Pareto distribution $G(a) = \frac{(a)^k - (a_L)^k}{(a_H)^k - (a_L)^k}$ with support $[a_L, a_H]$ and shape parameter $k > \varepsilon - 1$.

Introduction
oooooo

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
o●o

Estimation Procedure
ooo

Data
o

Results
oooo

Gravity Model

Using the pricing rules, operating profits can be written as

- $\pi_{ij}^e(a) = (1-\alpha)\left(\tau_{ij}c_i^e a / \alpha P_j\right)^{1-\varepsilon} Y_j - c_i^e f_{ij}^e$

  $\pi_{ij}^f(a) = (1-\alpha)\left(c_j^f a / \alpha P_j\right)^{1-\varepsilon} Y_j - c_j^f f_{ij}^f$

A firm will

- export if profit opportunities exist or
- engage in FDI if affiliate profits exceed export profits.

Introduction
000000

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
0●0

Estimation Procedure
000

Data
0

Results
0000

Gravity Model

Using the pricing rules, operating profits can be written as

- $\pi_{ij}^e(a) = (1-\alpha)\left(\tau_{ij}c_i^e a/\alpha P_j\right)^{1-\varepsilon} Y_j - c_i^e f_{ij}^e$

  $\pi_{ij}^f(a) = (1-\alpha)\left(c_j^f a/\alpha P_j\right)^{1-\varepsilon} Y_j - c_j^f f_{ij}^f$

A firm will

- export if profit opportunities exist or

- engage in FDI if affiliate profits exceed export profits.

MNE fixed costs sufficiently larger than fixed export costs:

- mid-level productive firms $a \in [a_{ij}^f, a_{ij}^e]$ will export

- most productive firms with $a \in [a_L, a_{ij}^f]$ engage in FDI.

The cutoff per-unit input requirements, a_{ij}^e and a_{ij}^f satisfy:

- $\pi_{ij}^e\left(a_{ij}^e\right) = 0$ and $\pi_{ij}^f\left(a_{ij}^f\right) - \pi_{ij}^e\left(a_{ij}^f\right) = 0$.

Gravity Model

Total value of exports:
$$M_{ij}^e = \left(\frac{\tau_{ij} c_i^e}{\left(1 - \frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right) P_j} \right)^{1-\varepsilon} Y_j N_i V_{ij}^e,$$
where

- N_i is the measure of firms in i.

- $V_{ij}^e = \frac{k \left(a_{ij}^f \right)^{k-\varepsilon+1}}{\left(a_H^k - a_L^k \right)(k-\varepsilon+1)} W_{ij}^e$ and

  $W_{ij}^e = \max \left(\left(\frac{a_{ij}^e}{a_{ij}^f} \right)^{k-\varepsilon+1} - 1, 0 \right)$

- V_{ij}^e and W_{ij}^e
  - include the endogenous export a_{ij}^e and MNE cutoff a_{ij}^f
  - convert the proportion of exporting firms into bilateral trade impacts

Stage 1 MNE Selection

At least one MNE operates in destination market j

- ▶ if and only if $\pi_{ij}^{f}(a_L) > \pi_{ij}^{e}(a_L)$.

Stage 1 MNE Selection

At least one MNE operates in destination market j

▶ if and only if $\pi_{ij}^f(a_L) > \pi_{ij}^e(a_L)$.

Probit equation for FDI

$$\rho_{ij}^f = \Phi\left(\gamma_0^{f*} + \zeta_i^{f*} + \zeta_j^{f*} + \beta_1^* d_{ij} - \beta_2^* b_{ij}^{fe} - \kappa^* \phi_{ij}^{fe} + \eta_{ij}^{f*}\right),$$

▶ $\Phi(\cdot)$ is standard-normal CDF; asterisk coef divided by $\sigma_{\eta_{ij}^f}$.

▶ Variable costs include

    ▶ trade frictions, d_{ij}

    ▶ relative variable cost of MNE versus exporting, b_{ij}^{fe}.

    ▶ relative fixed cost of MNE versus exporting, ϕ_{ij}^{fe}.

Stage 1 MNE Selection

At least one MNE operates in destination market j

▶ if and only if $\pi_{ij}^{f}(a_L) > \pi_{ij}^{e}(a_L)$.

Probit equation for FDI

$$\rho_{ij}^{f} = \Phi\left(\gamma_0^{f*} + \zeta_i^{f*} + \zeta_j^{f*} + \beta_1^* d_{ij} - \beta_2^* b_{ij}^{fe} - \kappa^* \phi_{ij}^{fe} + \eta_{ij}^{f*}\right),$$

▶ $\Phi(\cdot)$ is standard-normal CDF; asterisk coef divided by $\sigma_{\eta_{ij}^f}$.

▶ Variable costs include

    ▶ trade frictions, d_{ij}

    ▶ relative variable cost of MNE versus exporting, b_{ij}^{fe}.

    ▶ relative fixed cost of MNE versus exporting, ϕ_{ij}^{fe}.

Higher trade costs $\implies$ probability of MNE will be higher.

▶ $\hat{z}_{ij}^{f} = \Phi^{-1}\left(\hat{\rho}_{ij}^{f}\right)$ feeds into the 2nd- and 3rd-stages

Stage 2 Export Selection

As least one firm exports to the destination market j

- ▶ if and only if firms with unit-cost at or above a_{ij}^f

- ▶ earn positive export profits $\pi_{ij}^e \left(a_{ij}^f \right) > 0$

Introduction
oooooo
Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
ooo
Estimation Procedure
o●o
Data
o
Results
oooo

Stage 2 Export Selection

As least one firm exports to the destination market j

▶ if and only if firms with unit-cost at or above a_{ij}^f

▶ earn positive export profits $\pi_{ij}^e \left(a_{ij}^f \right) > 0$

Probit equation for exporting from country i to j is
$$\rho_{ij}^e = \Phi \left(\lambda_1^{e*} + \xi_i^{e*} + \xi_j^{e*} - \gamma^{e*} d_{ij} - \kappa^{e*} \phi_{ij}^e - \varsigma^{e*} \hat{z}_{ij}^f + \eta_{ij}^{e*} \right),$$
depends on endogenous variable a_{ij}^f through $\hat{z}_{ij}^f$.

Introduction
oooooo
Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
ooo
Estimation Procedure
oo●
Data
o
Results
oooo

Stage 3 Gravity Estimation

The gravity equation can be rewritten as

$$M_{ij}^e = \exp\left[\mu_0^e + \chi_i^e + \chi_j^e - \gamma d_{ij} + \theta_{ij}^e + \omega_{ij}^e\right] + u_{ij}^e, \qquad (1)$$

where $\theta_{ij}^e = \psi_1^e \hat{z}_{ij}^f$ and $\omega_{ij}^e = \ln\left[\exp\left(\delta^e z_{ij}^{e*}\right) - 1\right]$.

Stage 3 Gravity Estimation

The gravity equation can be rewritten as

$$M_{ij}^e = \exp\left[\mu_0^e + \chi_i^e + \chi_j^e - \gamma d_{ij} + \theta_{ij}^e + \omega_{ij}^e\right] + u_{ij}^e, \qquad (1)$$

where $\theta_{ij}^e = \psi_1^e \hat{z}_{ij}^f$ and $\omega_{ij}^e = \ln\left[\exp\left(\delta^e z_{ij}^{e*}\right) - 1\right]$.

Relax truncated Pareto assumption; no analytical solution V_{ij}^e.

▶ Implementing the nonparameteric technique of HMR.

▶ $\hat{\rho}_{ij}^e$ are ranked and partitioned into 250 bins of equal size

▶ I_b^e is equal to one for $\hat{\rho}_{ij}^e$ in bin b and zero otherwise.

$$M_{ij}^e = \exp\left[\beta_0^e + \chi_i^e + \chi_j^e - \gamma d_{ij} + I_b^e\right] + u_{ij}^e. \qquad (2)$$

Data and Sources

- ▶ EuroStat: Bilateral trade and MNE panel data
  - ▶ 28 EU member countries and 132 countries
  - ▶ 2010 to 2016
- ▶ USTIC, Dynamic Gravity Dataset: trade friction variables
- ▶ Economic Freedom of the World
  - ▶ Fixed Trade Costs:
    - ▶ regulatory trade barriers, the non-tariff trade barriers, and compliance cost of importing and exporting indexes
  - ▶ Relative cost of production b/t home and destination:
    - ▶ centralized collective bargaining, labor market regulations, and hiring regulations and minimum wage.
  - ▶ Relative fixed MNE costs to fixed trade costs
    - ▶ extra payments/bribes/favoritism, administrative requirements, licensing restrictions

Results

	Baseline	Two-Stage		Three-Stage		
	Gravity	Trade Sel	Gravity	FDI Sel	Trade Sel	Gravity
Dist	-0.11*	0.08*	-0.04*	-0.28*	-0.06*	-0.08*
Com Lang	-0.52*	-0.01*	-0.62*	-0.22*	-0.12*	-0.53*
Cont Bor	1.97*	0.27*	2.42*	0.93*	0.82*	2.26*
Colony	0.69*	0.73*	2.42*	0.61*	1.05*	1.95*
FTA	0.16*	0.51*	0.68*	0.06*	0.54*	0.48*
Fix Trade		0.76*			0.67*	
Rel Var				-40.38*		
Rel Fix MNE				65.87*		
$\hat{z}_{ij}^f$					-0.96*	
I^b (250 bins)	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes

Results

	Baseline	Two-Stage		Three-Stage		
	Gravity	Trade Sel	Gravity	FDI Sel	Trade Sel	Gravity
Dist	-0.11*	0.08*	-0.04*	-0.28*	-0.06*	-0.08*
Com Lang	-0.52*	-0.01*	-0.62*	-0.22*	-0.12*	-0.53*
Cont Bor	1.97*	0.27*	2.42*	0.93*	0.82*	2.26*
Colony	0.69*	0.73*	2.42*	0.61*	1.05*	1.95*
FTA	0.16*	0.51*	0.68*	0.06*	0.54*	0.48*
Fix Trade		0.76*			0.67*	
Rel Var				-40.38*		
Rel Fix MNE				65.87*		
$\hat{z}_{ij}^{f}$					-0.96*	
I^{b} (250 bins)	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes

Introduction
000000
Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
000
Estimation Procedure
000
Data
0
Results
0000

Results

	Baseline	Two-Stage		Three-Stage		
	Gravity	Trade Sel	Gravity	FDI Sel	Trade Sel	Gravity
Dist	-0.11*	0.08*	-0.04*	-0.28*	-0.06*	-0.08*
Com Lang	-0.52*	-0.01*	-0.62*	-0.22*	-0.12*	-0.53*
Cont Bor	1.97*	0.27*	2.42*	0.93*	0.82*	2.26*
Colony	0.69*	0.73*	2.42*	0.61*	1.05*	1.95*
FTA	0.16*	0.51*	0.68*	0.06*	0.54*	0.48*
Fix Trade		0.76*			0.67*	
Rel Var				-40.38*		
Rel Fix MNE				65.87*		
$\hat{z}_{ij}^f$					-0.96*	
I^b (250 bins)	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes

Introduction
000000

Gravity Model with Horizontal FDI
000

Estimation Procedure
000

Data
0

Results
000●

Results

	Baseline	Two-Stage		Three-Stage		
	Gravity	Trade Sel	Gravity	FDI Sel	Trade Sel	Gravity
Dist	-0.11*	0.08*	-0.04*	-0.28*	-0.06*	-0.08*
Com Lang	-0.52*	-0.01*	-0.62*	-0.22*	-0.12*	-0.53*
Cont Bor	1.97*	0.27*	2.42*	0.93*	0.82*	2.26*
Colony	0.69*	0.73*	2.42*	0.61*	1.05*	1.95*
FTA	0.16*	0.51*	0.68*	0.06*	0.54*	0.48*
Fix Trade		0.76*			0.67*	
Rel Var				-40.38*		
Rel Fix MNE				65.87*		
$\hat{z}_{ij}^{f}$					-0.96*	
I^{b} (250 bins)	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes