AgEcon SEARCH
RESEARCH IN AGRICULTURAL & APPLIED ECONOMICS

The World's Largest Open Access Agricultural & Applied Economics Digital Library

This document is discoverable and free to researchers across the globe due to the work of AgEcon Search.

Help ensure our sustainability.

Give to AgEcon Search

AgEcon Search
http://ageconsearch.umn.edu
aesearch@umn.edu

*Papers downloaded from **AgEcon Search** may be used for non-commercial purposes and personal study only. No other use, including posting to another Internet site, is permitted without permission from the copyright owner (not AgEcon Search), or as allowed under the provisions of Fair Use, U.S. Copyright Act, Title 17 U.S.C.*

CANTER

Disc. Pap. F8903

Department of Economics
UNIVERSITY OF CANTERBURY
CHRISTCHURCH, NEW ZEALAND

GIANNINI FOUNDATION OF
AGRICULTURAL ECONOMICS
LIBRARY

JUL 13 1989

COEFFICIENT SIGN CHANGES WHEN RESTRICTING REGRESSION MODELS UNDER INSTRUMENTAL VARIABLES ESTIMATION

DAVID E. A. GILES

Discussion Paper

No.8903

Department of Economics University of Canterbury
Christchurch, New Zealand

Discussion Paper No. 8903

May 1989

COEFFICIENT SIGN CHANGES WHEN RESTRICTING REGRESSION MODELS UNDER INSTRUMENTAL VARIABLES ESTIMATION*

DAVID E. A. GILES

This paper is circulated for discussion and comments. It should not be quoted without the prior approval of the author.

* Darren Gibbs asked some interesting questions which lead the author to prepare this note.

It is now well known that deleting a variable from (or otherwise restricting the coefficients of) a least squares regression model has implications for the signs of the remaining variables' coefficients which are predictable under certain conditions. This topic was discussed by Leamer (1975) who showed, among other things, that if the absolute t-value associated with the deleted variable is less than that associated with another variable in the model, then the sign of the latter's estimated coefficient cannot change as a result of the deletion. Leamer's necessary condition was extended to include a sufficient condition by Visco (1978); was presented in a simple alternative form by Oksanen (1987); and was generalised by McAleer et al. (1986) to apply to situations where the deleted variables are combined in arbitrary linear combinations (such as in certain distributed lag models). See, also, Visco (1988).

The results obtained by these authors are extremely useful to the applied econometrician - certain possibilities may be ruled out, a priori, simply by inspecting the values of appropriate t-values or F-statistics. However, all of these results are derived only in the context of Ordinary Least Squares (O.L.S.) estimation. Given the widesperad use of estimators in the Instrumental Variables (I.V.) family, it is interesting to ask whether similar results hold in this more general context. If so, then prescriptions could be made to cover the estimation of structural equations from simultaneous systems, as well as dynamic models with autocorrelated errors, for example.

This question is readily answered. As Oksanen (1987, p.229) notes, the existing results relate to a problem in the algebra

(not statistics) of least squares. The algebra of I.V. estimation can be written in a form analogous to that of O.L.S., and so the results of interest hold in the I.V. case too. To see this, let the model be

$$y = X\beta + u \; ; \qquad E(u) = 0 \; ; \qquad V(u) = \sigma^2 I$$

where X is (Txk) with at least some columns stochastic, and $E(u|X) \neq 0$. Let the (Txg) instrument matrix be Z, with $g \geq k$. Assume that X and Z each have full column rank and that

$$\text{plim } (T^{-1}X'Z) = \Sigma_{xz} \; ; \quad \text{plim } (T^{-1}Z'Z) = \Sigma_{zz}$$

where Σ_{xz} and Σ_{zz} are both finite and of rank k and g respectively. By the Mann-Wald Theorem, $(T^{-\frac{1}{2}}Z'u) \xrightarrow{d} N(0,\sigma^2\Sigma_{zz})$.

The general I.V. estimator of β is

$$\hat{\beta} = (X'MX)^{-1}X'My \; ,$$

where $M = Z(Z'Z)^{-1}Z'$, and is idempotent. The usual consistent estimator of the asymptotic covariance matrix of $\hat{\beta}$ is $V = s^2(X'MX)^{-1}$, where $s^2 = (y-X\hat{\beta})'(y-X\hat{\beta})/T$.

If q exact linear independent restrictions are placed on the elements of β, we have $R\beta = r$, where R is (qxk) and of rank q. The restricted I.V. estimator is (see, e.g., Giles, 1982)

$$\hat{\beta}^* = \hat{\beta} - (X'MX)^{-1}R'[R(X'MX)^{-1}R']^{-1}(R\hat{\beta}-r) \; ,$$

and the validity of the restrictions may be tested via the Wald (and Lagrange Multiplier) test statistic

$$W = (R\hat{\beta}-r)'[R(X'MX)^{-1}R']^{-1}(R\hat{\beta}-r)/s^2.$$

Under the null, W is asymptotically χ^2_q (see, e.g., Giles, 1982).

Now, because M is idempotent, defining $X^* = MX$, we have:

$$\hat{\beta} = (X^{*\prime}X^*)^{-1}X^{*\prime}y$$

$$\hat{\beta}^* = \hat{\beta} - (X^{*\prime}X^*)^{-1}R'[R(X^{*\prime}X^*)^{-1}R']^{-1}(R\hat{\beta}-r)$$

$$V = s^2(X^{*\prime}X^*)^{-1}$$

$$W = (R\hat{\beta}-r)'[R(X^{*\prime}X^*)^{-1}R']^{-1}(R\hat{\beta}-r)/s^2$$

$$= (\hat{u}^{*\prime}\hat{u}^* - \hat{u}'\hat{u})/s^2 .$$

So, in this transformed space the algebra of I.V. estimation is the same as that of O.L.S. estimation in the original space. Accordingly, the results of all of the authors referred to at the beginning of this note hold precisely if I.V., rather than O.L.S. estimation is used. For example, the "asymptotic-t-values" reported with I.V. estimates are of the form $t_i = (\beta_i/V_{ii}^{\frac{1}{2}})$ for the i'th element of β. Although t_i is asymptotically standard normal, rather than t-distributed, its algebraic structure is identical to that of its least squares counterpart. Accordingly, the proof of the Lemma given by Leamer (1975, p.38) follows exactly in this case: there cannot be a sign change for a regression coefficient estimated by I.V. when the absolute "asymptotic t-value " for that coefficient exceeds that of the coefficient for the deleted variable.

The algebra of I.V. estimation, rather than any statistical assumptions, facilitate this generalisation of the results. Given the widespread application of I.V. estimators in econometrics, this observation should be of assistance to applied researchers.

5 May, 1989

REFERENCES

Giles, D.E.A. (1982). 'Instrumental Variables Estimation With Linear Restrictions', Sankhyā : The Indian Journal of Statistics, B, Vol. 44, pp. 343-350.

Leamer, E.E. (1975). 'A Result on the Sign of Restricted Least-Squares Estimates', Journal of Econometrics, Vol. 3, pp. 387-390.

McAleer, M., A. Pagan and I. Visco (1986). 'A Further Result on the Sign of Restricted Least-Squares Estimates', Journal of Econometrics, Vol. 32, pp. 287-290.

Oksanen, E.H. (1987). 'On Sign Changes Upon Deletion of a Variable in Linear Regression Analysis', Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics, Vol. 49, pp. 227-229.

Visco, I. (1978). 'On Obtaining the Right Sign of a Coefficient Estimate by Omitting a Variable From the Regression', Journal of Econometrics, Vol. 7, pp. 115-117.

Visco, I. (1988). 'Again on Sign Changes Upon Deletion of a Linear Regression', Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics, Vol. 50, pp. 225-227.

LIST OF DISCUSSION PAPERS*

No. 8401 Optimal Search, by Peter B. Morgan and Richard Manning.

No. 8402 Regional Production Relationships During the Industrialization of New Zealand, 1935-1948, by David E. A. Giles and Peter Hampton.

No. 8403 Pricing Strategies for a Non-Replenishable Item Under Variable Demand and Inflation, by John A. George.

No. 8404 Alienation Rights in Traditional Maori Society, by Brent Layton.

No. 8405 An Engel Curve Analysis of Household Expenditure in New Zealand, by David E. A. Giles and Peter Hampton.

No. 8406 Paying for Public Inputs, by Richard Manning, James R. Markusen, and John McMillan.

No. 8501 Perfectly Discriminatory Policies in International Trade, by Richard Manning and Koon-Lam Shea.

No. 8502 Perfectly Discriminatory Policy Towards International Capital Movements in a Dynamic World, by Richard Manning and Koon-Lam Shea.

No. 8503 A Regional Consumer Demand Model for New Zealand, by David E. A. Giles and Peter Hampton.

No. 8504 Optimal Human and Physical Capital Accumulation in a Fixed-Coefficients Economy, by R. Manning.

No. 8601 Estimating the Error Variance in Regression After a Preliminary Test of Restrictions on the Coefficients, by David E. A. Giles, Judith A. Mikolajczyk and T. Dudley Wallace.

No. 8602 Search While Consuming, by Richard Manning.

No. 8603 Implementing Computable General Equilibrium Models: Data Preparation, Calibration, and Replication, by K. R. Henry, R. Manning, E. McCann and A. E. Woodfield.

No. 8604 Credit Rationing: A Further Remark, by John G. Riley.

No. 8605 Preliminary-Test Estimation in Mis-Specified Regressions, by David E. A. Giles.

No. 8606 The Positive-Part Stein-Rule Estimator and Tests of Linear Hypotheses, by Aman Ullah and David E. A. Giles.

No. 8607 Production Functions that are Consistent with an Arbitrary Production-Possibility Frontier, by Richard Manning.

No. 8608 Preliminary-Test Estimation of the Error Variance in Linear Regression, by Judith A. Clarke, David E. A. Giles and T. Dudley Wallace.

No. 8609 Dual Dynamic Programming for Linear Production/Inventory Systems, by E. Grant Read and John A. George.

No. 8610 Ownership Concentration and the Efficiency of Monopoly, by R. Manning.

No. 8701 Stochastic Simulation of the Reserve Bank's Model of the New Zealand Economy, by J. N. Lye.

No. 8702 Urban Expenditure Patterns in New Zealand, by Peter Hampton and David E. A. Giles.

No. 8703 Preliminary-Test Estimation of Mis-Specified Regression Models, by David E. A. Giles.

No. 8704 Instrumental Variables Regression Without an Intercept, by David E. A. Giles and Robin W. Harrison.

No. 8705 Household Expenditure in Sri Lanka: An Engel Curve Analysis, by Mallika Dissanayake and David E. A Giles.

No. 8706 Preliminary-Test Estimation of the Standard Error of Estimate in Linear Regression, by Judith A. Clarke.

(continued on back cover)

No. 8707 Invariance Results for FIML Estimation of an Integrated Model of Expenditure and Portfolio Behaviour, by P. Dorian Owen.

No. 8708 Social Cost and Benefit as a Basis for Industry Regulation with Special Reference to the Tobacco Industry, by Alan E. Woodfield.

No. 8709 The Estimation of Allocation Models With Autocorrelated Disturbances, by David E. A. Giles.

No. 8710 Aggregate Demand Curves in General-Equilibrium Macroeconomic Models: Comparisons with Partial-Equilibrium Microeconomic Demand Curves, by P. Dorian Owen.

No. 8711 Alternative Aggregate Demand Functions in Macro-economics: A Comment, by P. Dorian Owen.

No. 8712 Evaluation of the Two-Stage Least Squares Distribution Function by Imhof's Procedure by P. Cribbett, J. N. Lye and A. Ullah.

No. 8713 The Size of the Underground Economy: Problems and Evidence, by Michael Carter.

No. 8714 A Computable General Equilibrium Model of a Fisherine Method to Close the Foreign Sector, by Ewen McCann and Keith Mclaren.

No. 8715 Preliminary-Test Estimation of the Scale Parameter in a Mis-Specified Regression Model, by David E. A. Giles and Judith A. Clarke.

No. 8716 A Simple Graphical Proof of Arrow's Impossibility Theorem, by John Fountain.

No. 8717 Rational Choice and Implementation of Social Decision Functions, by Manimay Sen.

No. 8718 Divisia Monetary Aggregates for New Zealand, by Ewen McCann and David E. A. Giles.

No. 8719 Telecommunications in New Zealand: The Case for Reform, by John Fountain.

No. 8801 Workers' Compensation Rates and the Demand for Apprentices and Non-Apprentices in Victoria, by Pasquale M. Sgro and David E. A. Giles.

No. 8802 The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes, the 48% Solution, by Michael Carter.

No. 8803 The Exact Distribution of a Simple Pre-Test Estimator, by David E. A. Giles.

No. 8804 Pre-testing for Linear Restrictions in a Regression Model With Student-t Errors, by Judith A. Clarke.

No. 8805 Divisia Monetary Aggregates and the Real User Cost of Money, by Ewen McCann and David Giles.

No. 8806 The Management of New Zealand's Lobster Fishery, by Alan Woodfield and Pim Borren.

No. 8807 Poverty Measurement: A Generalization of Sen's Result, by Prasanta K. Pattanaik and Manimay Sen.

No. 8808 A Note on Sen's Normalization Axiom for a Poverty Measure, by Prasanta K. Pattanaik and Manimay Sen.

No. 8809 Budget Deficits and Asset Sales, by Ewen McCann.

No. 8810 Unorganized Money Markets and 'Unproductive' Assets in the New Structuralist Critique of Financial Liberalization, by P. Dorian Owen and Otton Solis-Fallas.

No. 8901 Testing for Financial Buffer Stocks in Sectoral Portfolio Models, by P. Dorian Owen.

No. 8902 Provisional Data and Unbiased Prediction of Economic Time Series by Karen Browning and David Giles.

No. 8903 Coefficient sign changes when restricting regression models under instrumental variables estimation, by David E. A. Giles.

* Copies of these Discussion Papers may be obtained for $4 (including postage, price changes occasionally) each by writing to the Secretary, Department of Economics, University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand.