

The World's Largest Open Access Agricultural & Applied Economics Digital Library

This document is discoverable and free to researchers across the globe due to the work of AgEcon Search.

Help ensure our sustainability.

Give to AgEcon Search

AgEcon Search
http://ageconsearch.umn.edu
aesearch@umn.edu

Papers downloaded from **AgEcon Search** may be used for non-commercial purposes and personal study only. No other use, including posting to another Internet site, is permitted without permission from the copyright owner (not AgEcon Search), or as allowed under the provisions of Fair Use, U.S. Copyright Act, Title 17 U.S.C.



Technical approaches in collaborative stakeholder decision making

Simon Harris¹, Melissa Robson, & Ned Norton

¹ Harris Consulting, N.Z.

Paper presented at the 2014 NZARES Conference

Tahuna Conference Centre, Nelson, New Zealand. August 28-29, 2014

TECHNICAL APPROACHES IN COLLABORATIVE STAKEHOLDER DECISION MAKING

SIMON HARRIS, MELISSA ROBSON, NED NORTON

COLLABORATIVE STAKEHOLDER DECISION MAKING

- WICKED PROBLEMS UNCERTAINTY, MULTIPLE PERSPECTIVES, NON UNIQUE SOLUTIONS
- STAKEHOLDER DECISION MAKING
 - ACCEPTABLE VS OPTIMAL
 - TIME BOUND
 - LEARNING PROCESS
- TECHNICAL TEAM
 - SUPPORTS
 - LARGE
 - VERY DIFFICULT ROLE
- HOW DO TECHNICAL TEAMS DECIDE WHAT TO DO?
- FRESHWATER MANAGEMENT AS EXAMPLE



FRAMEWORK

Variables

- Complexity
- Data inputs (existing/new)
- Disciplines
- Model types
- Model integration
- Quantitative vs
- qualitative
- Outputs (range, detail)
- Interaction between disciplines

Constraints

Time Resource Uncertainty

Output characteristics

- Who is making decision (internal/external?)
- Policy options
- Nature of Decision (consensus, decide/defend etc.)
- Error type and direction
- Expertise of decision makers
- Learning/answer
- Values of importance



OUTPUT CHARACTERISTICS

- EXPERTISE OF USERS
- LEARNING VS ANSWER
- VALUES ADDRESSED
- POLICY OPTIONS AVAILABLE
- ERROR TYPE
- NATURE OF DECISION MAKING (CONSENSUS VS MAJORITY)
- INVOLVEMENT OF THE TECHNICAL TEAM IN THE DECISION MAKING
- FACE TIME, DECISION MAKING TIME



FRAMEWORK

Variables

- Complexity
- Data inputs (existing/new)
- Disciplines
- Model types
- Model integration
- Quantitative vs
- qualitative
- Outputs (range, detail)
- Interaction between disciplines

Constraints

Time Resource Uncertainty

Output characteristics

- Who is making decision (internal/external?)
- Policy options
- Nature of Decision (consensus, decide/defend etc.)
- Error type and direction
- Expertise of decision makers
- Learning/answer
- Values of importance



CONSTRAINTS

- TIME NEVER ENOUGH
- RESOURCES PEOPLE AVAILABILITY IS AS IMPORTANT AS \$
- UNCERTAINTY INTRACTABLE



FRAMEWORK

Variables

- Complexity
- Data inputs (existing/new)
- Disciplines
- Model types
- Model integration
- Quantitative vs
- qualitative
- Outputs (range, detail)
- Interaction between disciplines

Constraints

Time Resource Uncertainty

Output characteristics

- Who is making decision (internal/external?)
- Policy options
- Nature of Decision (consensus, decide/defend etc.)
- Error type and direction
- Expertise of decision makers
- Learning/answer
- Values of importance



- NATURE OF DECISION CONTESTED TEND TO REQUIRE MORE REPRESENTATIVE MODELS
- LEARNING COMPLEXITY CAN WORK AGAINST LEARNING
- ERROR TYPE
- MODEL TYPE
- DATA
- INTERACTION BETWEEN MODELS (SEE NEXT)



DATA

- DECISION TYPE THE MORE CONTESTED THE FINAL DECISION WILL BE, THE MORE DATA INTENSIVE
- LEARNING DATA COLLECTION CAN BE USEFUL LEARNING
- VALUES



DISCIPLINES

- COVER VALUES TO BE ADDRESSED
- NATURE OF DECISION (STAKEHOLDER CONSENSUS MAY BE MORE FLEXIBLE)
- EXPERTISE CAN SUBSTITUTE STAKEHOLDER EXPERTISE FOR TECHNICAL
- POLICY OPTIONS SOME DISCIPLINES CAN'T BE ADDRESSED



MODEL TYPES

- EG STATISTICAL, SIMULATION, OPTIMISATION, SPATIAL, BBN, NARRATIVE
- NEED TO CONSIDER
 - POLICY OPTIONS
 - LEARNING AND EXPERTISE
 - ERROR TYPE
 - DATA AVAILABILITY AND ACCURACY



MODEL INTERACTION

- INTERACTION BETWEEN MODELS GENERATES
 - · COMPLEXITY,
 - CALIBRATION PROBLEMS,
 - FLEXIBILITY ISSUES, AND
 - BOTTLENECKS



OUTPUTS - RANGE AND DETAIL

- DECISION MAKERS OFTEN LAY PEOPLE
- HAVE LIMITED TIME TO DIGEST ISSUES OUTSIDE MEETINGS.
- HAVE EVEN LESS TIME IN MEETING FOR TECHNICAL INPUTS
- LIMITED NUMBER OF THINGS THEY CAN CONSIDER
- WITH LONG PROCESSES FORGET WHAT THEY LEARNED
- NEED TO BE REALISTIC ABOUT WHAT WE PRODUCE FOCUS ON KEY INDICATORS
- HELICOPTER VIEW INITIALLY, THEN FOCUS ON KEY STICKING POINTS



- NATURE OF DECISION
- INVOLVEMENT IN DECISION
- LEARNING
- DECISION MAKER EXPERTISE
- KEY TO DEVELOPING UNDERSTANDING AND SOLUTIONS



DISCUSSION

- STAKEHOLDER PROJECTS ARE MESSY
- PRECISION OVER-RATED
- UNCERTAINTY HIGHLY LIMITING
- REALITY OF DEALING WITH STAKEHOLDER GROUPS TIME, EXPERTISE, IMPORTANCE IN DECISION
- INTERACTION OF PEOPLE OVER MODELS