One Vote for Doering's Call for Nonmarginal Analysis

Gerald F. Vaughn

This is in support of Otto C. Doering's article "Looking Back While Going Forward An Essential for Policy Economists" (JAER, Vol 43, No 1). He asserts that marginal analysis is best suited to a stable economy or society. Doering believes that the US and world systems are beyond stability, rendering marginal analysis less helpful, and that the development of nonmarginalist economics should accelerate to meet the needs of public policy. I agree with this call for nonmarginal analysis.

Robert B. Carson, in his book What Economists Know, even more sharply criticizes both the economics profession and policymakers. He writes "in the 1970s and 1980s, when there was much to be done, practically nothing of useful and lasting consequence was accomplished—not in terms of important theoretical and critical work nor in terms of policymaking" (p. 8). Nonmarginal analysis would contribute in ways that Carson desires.

For nonmarginalist economics to be useful to governments, public policymakers and program managers first must be receptive to it. And, that acceptance depends on what type of government is in office.

Richard J. Stillman II, who examines public administration, places government into four models: negative-state (or no-state), bold-state, pre-state, and pro-state. Negative-state is characterized by a sharply limited role for government (monetarists and public choice theorists), bold-state by a broadly expanded role (institution builders), pre-state by traditional norms typical of governments before World War II, and pro-state by technocracy (government by professional public administrators and scientific experts) typified by governments since 1945. In both pre-state and pro-state, change occurs in small increments at the margin.

Only negative-state and bold-state, which are departures from the trend, have shown a receptiveness to nonmarginalist economics, and neither of the two prevails except in a crisis. That is, when government seems too wasteful or intrusive, the negative-state gains ascendancy for a time. When government needs a stronger hand in depression or war, the bold-state presides.

Nonmarginal analysis and action are most likely to be needed and to happen during a crisis. Agricultural economists can expect nonmarginalist economics to be best received at such times. John J. Gargan in Handbook of Public Administration observes: "Policy problem solutions drawn from Public Choice theory—privatization, vouchers, and voluntary initiatives—were applied by local, state, and national government during the 1970s and 1980s, partly because of the pressure on public finances, but also because of the availability of the solutions" (p. 1,004).

As Dr. Doering points out, during the 1930's and New Deal experimentation, USDA not only was receptive to, but was in the vanguard of, thinking of rural social scientists as reformers in farm policy (pp 4-5).

Apart from times of crisis, government will tend to be in the pre-state or pro-state models, where change usually occurs at the margin. Agricultural economists working in or closely with government should not expect that nonmarginalist thinking will be accepted or prove useful between crises. Though cast in relation mainly to the Federal Government, the principle is the same for State and local governments.

What should nonmarginalists do, given these conditions? Kenneth Boulding, in The Impact of the Social Sciences, reminds: "Economists are not altogether guiltless of presuming to know more than they do and of giving advice when they should have been doing research" (p. 50).

Nonmarginalist agricultural economists should concentrate, therefore, on doing research (especially high-quality empirical studies) that will be ready and useful if and when advice is wanted.

Bibliography

Carson, Robert B 1990 What Economists Know An Economic Policy Primer for the 1990s and Beyond New York St Martin's


Stillman, Richard J, II 1991 Preface to Public Administration A Search for Themes and Direction New York St Martin's

AGRICULTURAL ECONOMICS

The Journal of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE)

Agricultural Economics publishes articles covering a range of work done on agricultural economics. It is an international journal devoted to serving the interests of not only the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) but also of agricultural economists all over the world. The Journal provides a focal point for the publication of work on research, extension and out-reach, consulting, advising, entrepreneurship, administration, and teaching in the following areas of agricultural economics:

- disciplinary work - improvement of theories, techniques, and descriptive knowledge of economics and its contributing disciplines, e.g., statistics, mathematics, and philosophy

- multi-disciplinary subject matter areas - energy, technical change, institutional change, natural resources, farm management, rural communities, marketing, human development, and the environment, areas which are important to organised groups of public and private decision makers facing well-defined sets of problems

- problem solving - the definition, solution and management of specific practical problems

Elsevier Science Publishers
PO Box 181 1000 AD Amsterdam
The Netherlands
Fax (020) 580-3-249

Elsevier Science Publishing Co Inc
Journal Information Center PO Box 882
Morris Square Station New York
NY 10013 USA
Tel (212) 633-1750 Fax (212) 633-1764

Please send your orders and requests for a complimentary copy and/or further information to one of the following addresses

Elsevier Science Publishers
PO Box 181 1000 AD Amsterdam
The Netherlands
Fax (020) 580-3-249

Elsevier Science Publishing Co Inc
Journal Information Center PO Box 882
Morris Square Station New York
NY 10013 USA
Tel (212) 633-1750 Fax (212) 633-1764

Prise en compte par l'Agence France Presse

Produced on high quality paper and printed in the USA by Byron Book Printers

52
Suggestions to Contributors for Submitting Manuscripts to The Journal of Agricultural Economics Research

1 SOURCE Indicate how the material submitted is related to the economic research program of the U.S. Department of Agriculture and its cooperating agencies. State your own connection with the program.

2 CLEARANCE Obtain any approval required in your own agency or institution before sending your manuscript to one of the editors of The Journal of Agricultural Economics Research. Attach a copy of such approval to the manuscript.

3 ORIGINALITY OF MATERIAL. It is our policy to print original material. We consider alternative treatments of material published elsewhere, but such treatments need to differ substantially from the original approach. When submitting your manuscript, identify related material either published or submitted for publication.

4 ABSTRACT Include an abstract and at least three keywords when you submit your article. The abstract should not exceed 100 words. It should report the major findings of your research.

5 NUMBER OF COPIES Submit three good copies.

6 TYING Double space everything, including abstract, footnotes, and references.

7 FOOTNOTES Number consecutively throughout the article.

8 REFERENCES Check all references carefully for accuracy and completeness. Cite references in the text by using underscored numbers in parentheses that correspond to items in the reference section at the end of your article.

9 CHARTS AND OTHER ARTWORK Use charts sparingly. Keep design as simple as possible. Submit all artwork in draft rather than in final form, accompanied by neatly prepared pages with essential data for replotting.
Want to Subscribe? Time to Renew?

Subscribe to the Journal of Agricultural Economics Research today. If you already subscribe to this timely periodical, note that expiration information about your subscription appears on the top line of your mailing label. Expiration information will appear in one of three formats: 1-AES-2 (this means you have TWO issues remaining in your subscription) or 940430 (expiration date is April 30, 1994) or APR94 (expiration date is April 1994). Disregard this notice if no renewal information appears. Call toll free, 1-800-999-6779, and tell us whether you want to subscribe or renew, or return this form to ERS-NASS, 341 Victory Drive, Herndon, VA 22070.

Journal of Agricultural Economics Research

Yes! I want to start my subscription

Yes! I want to renew my subscription

New subscribers:

Name ____________________________________________________________

Address ________________________________________________________

City, State, Zip __________________________________________________

Daytime phone ( ) __________________________

Payment method:

Bill me

Enclosed is $___________

Credit card orders:

Credit card number _____________________________________________

Card expiration date [Month/Year]

Total charges $___________

Credit card orders: ✔ MasterCard ☐ Visa Total charges $___________

For fastest service, call our toll-free order desk 1-800-999-6779 in the U.S. and Canada; other areas please call 703-834-0125, or FAX this page to 703-834-0110.