



AgEcon SEARCH
RESEARCH IN AGRICULTURAL & APPLIED ECONOMICS

The World's Largest Open Access Agricultural & Applied Economics Digital Library

This document is discoverable and free to researchers across the globe due to the work of AgEcon Search.

Help ensure our sustainability.

Give to AgEcon Search

AgEcon Search

<http://ageconsearch.umn.edu>

aesearch@umn.edu

*Papers downloaded from **AgEcon Search** may be used for non-commercial purposes and personal study only. No other use, including posting to another Internet site, is permitted without permission from the copyright owner (not AgEcon Search), or as allowed under the provisions of Fair Use, U.S. Copyright Act, Title 17 U.S.C.*

No endorsement of AgEcon Search or its fundraising activities by the author(s) of the following work or their employer(s) is intended or implied.



New Zealand Agricultural &
Resource Economics Society (Inc.)

**Implications of a Collaborative Approach to
Freshwater Policy: CWM and Other Cases**

Guy Salmon

Paper presented at the 2011 NZARES Conference

Tahuna Conference Centre – Nelson, New Zealand. August 25-26, 2011

*Copyright by author(s). Readers may make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only,
provided that this copyright notice appears on all such copies*

Implications of a collaborative approach to freshwater policy:

CWMS & other cases



Guy Salmon
NZARES Conference
26 August 2011

Canterbury case study



- ❖ Canterbury Water Management Strategy – Steering Group
- ❖ Focus on normative criteria for democratic governance, and on policy integration
- ❖ But some institutional/economic insights

Other case studies of collaborations on freshwater



- ❖ Land Use Futures Board – Lake Rotorua
- ❖ Taupo Lake Care network
- ❖ Land and Water Forum
- ❖ ICM Review & related case studies

Applying Ostrom

- ❖ She limits application of her theories in some situations, by including “situations in which the users can substantially harm one another, but not situations in which participants can produce major harm for others. Thus, all asymmetrical pollution problems are excluded, as is any situation in which a group can form a cartel...”
- ❖ Hearing the Other Side (Mutz 2006)
- ❖ Case study analysis needs to include a politics perspective, with particular attention to the balance of power in the external environment around the collective group.
- ❖ Need to evaluate whether resource management was actually improved – ICM Review points to a general lack of problem definition, measurable objectives, monitoring.
- ❖ Prevalent attitude - Anything will do as long as it's an alternative to regulation



Nordic findings: collaboration for policy

- ❖ In NZ the authorities consult then decide
- ❖ Nordics empower stakeholders to reach a consensus first
- ❖ Successful tradition of collaborative governance for policy depends on development of a political convention around the implementation of consensus recommendations.





CWMS - context

- ❖ Frustration of regulatory strategy – *Lynton Dairy*, water gold rush, adversarial science, divided governance
- ❖ Frustration of water storage advocates – barriers to private financing

Three key concepts



- ❖ New water
- ❖ Parallel development
- ❖ Voluntary brokering

Analysis of public input



- ❖ Four rounds of public input added legitimacy to Steering Group
- ❖ Most input taken up, but two major exceptions
- ❖ Drinking water vs healthy ecosystems: – participants opted to use other channels to resolve this
- ❖ Levy on water + no public subsidies: – Group had no advocate for wealth redistribution, and public assistance for new water was always a key.

Limits of collaboration?

“Nitrogen is now trading for \$400,000 a tonne, and most sheep and beef farmers have two or three of them. Once people realised there was value in nitrogen, the whole tone of the discussions changed. It became much tougher...”

Some conclusions

- ❖ Collaborative processes will tend to favour grand-parenting of rights to take and pollute – this creates a tension with PPP & NZ's fiscal circumstances
- ❖ Collaborative processes can support collection of rents if applied to ecological restoration
- ❖ Implementation risks can be symmetrically designed.



Questions?

www.ecologic.org.nz

